

CONSULTANCY REPORT

ASSESSMENT OF POLICY AND MODEL OF SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN VIETNAM

INTRODUCTION

The assessment of policies and models of sustainable tourism development in Vietnam is currently carried out at the request of the Swiss Tourism Project for Sustainable Development in Vietnam (ST4SD). The policy assessment aims to help the project management and implementing agencies gain the overview of the current policy for sustainable tourism development in Vietnam, recognize the limitations of the policy as well as the development models that are being applied, provide input data for the development of project documents and the development of detailed project implementation plans.

This consultancy mainly uses the qualitative research method to develop the assessment report, in which the collection and analysis of documents, secondary data as well as expert opinion on specific issues will be the key activities.

This policy assessment report focuses on several basic contents as following:

- Overview of the development of Vietnam's tourism up to now
- Current status of dialogue activities and public-private partnership in tourism development in Vietnam
- Operational status of the Vietnam Tourism Development Fund (VTDF)
- Some sets of criteria to evaluate tourism development in Vietnam
- Some suggestions and recommendations for related content

I. OVERVIEW OF VIETNAM TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

1.1. Development indicators

Vietnam's tourism industry is considered to be officially established on July 9, 1960 when the Government of Vietnam set up a Tourism Company under the Ministry of Foreign Trade. At that stage, Vietnam was still in the period of war against the US. The main purpose of the Vietnam Tourism Company establishment was to serve the activities of the Leaders of the Party and State of Vietnam, international experts on their business trip to Vietnam, as well as other foreign affairs of the country. In 1978, the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism (VNAT) was established, marking a new step in the State management of tourism. However, Vietnam's tourism only really started to develop in 1990 after the policy of Doi Moi - reform and open up Vietnam's economy implemented in 1986. In 1990, Vietnam organized the first tourism promotion activity by organizing the "National Tourism Year" event, encouraged people to travel domestically and attracted about 250,000 international tourists to Vietnam. Since this time, Vietnam's tourism has achieved rapid growth every year.

In 1994, Vietnam's tourism reached a milestone of welcoming 1 million international tourists. In 2016, Vietnam welcomed 10 million international visitors, and by 2019, this number has increased to 18 million, nearly doubling just in a period of 3 years (2016 - 2019). The number of domestic tourists also increased rapidly along with the fast and strong economic development of Vietnam before the outbreak COVID-19 pandemic. In 2010, domestic tourists in Vietnam only reached 28 million. In 2019, the number of domestic tourists reached 85 million, a threefold increase compared to 2010. In terms of total tourism revenue, in 2010, Vietnam's tourism only reached 96 trillion VND (equivalent to 5 billion USD) but by 2019, the total revenue from tourism

has reached 755 trillion VND, equivalent to 32 billion USD, accounting for 9.2% of Vietnam's GDP. In 2018, Vietnam was ranked 6th by UNWTO among 10 countries with the fastest tourism growth in the world. The system of technical facilities and infrastructure in tourism service is developing strongly; The system of tourism products has been established to meet the diverse demands of the market. The competitiveness of Vietnam's tourism is increasingly improving, ranking 63/140 countries and territories in 2019, up 17 places compared to 2011. It can be said that Vietnam's tourism industry is gradually asserting its position and role in the national economy, in the region and in the world.

1.2. Some policies and laws related to tourism development

On the Party's side: On 16 January 2017, the Politburo issued Resolution No.08 on determining the development of Vietnam's Tourism into a spearhead economic sector. This is the main document orientating the development of Tourism of Vietnam in the future.

On the State's side: Currently, the highest legal document on tourism is the Tourism Law. The Tourism Law was first promulgated in 2005 and then amended and supplemented in 2016, then came into force in 2017.

The 2017 Tourism Law covers all management activities of state management agencies in tourism, such as the promulgation of policies, tourism planning and promotion, travel enterprises and accommodation agencies management, VTDF management, tour guides management, etc. In addition to tourism law, so far Vietnam has many specific strategies and plans for tourism such as:

- Vietnam tourism development strategy to 2020, vision to 2030
- Vietnam tourism development strategy to 2030
- Master plan for tourism development in Vietnam to 2020, vision to 2030
- Planning of Vietnam's tourism system for the period of 2021 to 2030, vision to 2045.
- Vietnam tourism marketing strategy to 2020
- Vietnam tourism marketing strategy to 2030
- Strategy to develop tourism products in Vietnam to 2025, vision to 2030
- Strategy to develop Vietnam's tourism brand to 2025, vision to 2030.
- National tourism promotion program for the period 2011 to 2020
- National Action Program on Tourism 2011 to 2020
- Established Vietnam tourism development support fund in 2018 and officially come into operation in 2021.
- Project "Application of technology of Industry 4.0 to develop smart tourism, promote tourism to become a spearhead economic sector" promulgated in 2022
- The latest is Resolution 82/NQ-CP dated May 18, 2023 of the Government on the main tasks, solutions to accelerate the recovery and accelerate the effective and sustainable tourism development.

1.3. Limitations and challenges in sustainable tourism development in Vietnam

1.3.1. Some limitations in tourism development

Besides some of the above-mentioned results, Vietnam's tourism still has some limitations in development such as:

- The development of the tourism industry is not commensurate with the existing potential tourism resources. To compare with other countries in the region, our tourism products are not as rich, diverse and different as theirs, and have not captivated great attraction for international tourists. Therefore, the competitiveness of Vietnam's tourism is lower than some competitors in the ASEAN region such as Thailand, Singapore or Malaysia.

- Tourism human resources are both lacking and weak in terms of expertise and professionalism. The proportion of trained human resources serving directly in the tourism sector is quite low: 42% of the tourism workforce are not trained in tourism or trained in other industries and switch to tourism, 60% workers in the hotel sector have not been formally trained at the hotel vocational training schools.

- Investment funds for tourism promotion are still low, not commensurate with the scale and growth rate as well as the contribution of the tourism industry to the national economy. National tourism promotion program for the period 2011-2020, each year the Government allocates a budget of about 2.5 million USD for domestic and foreign tourism promotion activities. Meanwhile, the annual budget for tourism promotion of Thailand is about 100 million USD, Malaysia 80 million USD, Singapore 80 million USD, the Philippines about 60 million USD. These countries have also invested largely in exploring international tourism markets by establishing national tourism representative offices in key tourism markets. Up to now, Thailand has 32 overseas tourism promotion offices, Singapore has 23 offices, Malaysia has 22 offices and the Philippines has 18 offices.

- The Tourism Development Fund (VTDF) was established by the government in 2018 but it only came into operation until 2021 and was officially funded in 2022. However, due to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic as well as difficulties in budget allocation and disbursement procedures, the operation is not really effective.

- The policies of other related sectors (support tourism businesses such as visa policy, policies on land use tax in tourism, policies related to electricity prices in tourism, etc) only support the development of the tourism industry with limitations.

- The linkage between Ministries and sectors in the government in supporting tourism development is still limited. The development of the tourism industry depends heavily on other sectors and fields such as agriculture, transportation, banking, finance, healthcare, post and telecommunications, security and defense, etc. Recognizing the importance of interdisciplinary cooperation in tourism development, the Government of Vietnam has established a State Steering Committee on Tourism Development. The Committee Leader is a Deputy Prime Minister and members are leaders of related aforementioned Ministries. However, the activities of this Steering Committee have not been highly effective in practice. Up to now, the activities of this Steering Committee are suspended.

- The linkage within tourism businesses, between tourism businesses and other businesses in creating a full supply chain for tourism is still limited. Therefore, the product and service price of Vietnam tourism are still relatively low; thus not commensurate with the product quality. As a result, those factors reduce the competitiveness of Vietnam tourism product in comparison with other countries. Besides, due to the weak linkage, the Vietnam tourism enterprises are inferior to foreign-invested enterprises or foreign enterprises operating in Vietnam.

- Public-private cooperation in tourism development has attracted attention in recent years, but has not really been effective in tourism development. The voice of the private sector in tourism development policy making and implementation is still weak. Tourism businesses that receive government support in terms of policies and finance are few and uneven among provinces and regions.

Besides some of the above limitations, the COVID-19 pandemic has seriously affected the development of Vietnam's tourism industry. In 2021, according to statistics from the VNAT, over 90% of travel businesses have had to close, especially those welcoming inbound tourists. Some businesses have to change their customers and start to invest in the domestic market. In 2020,

Vietnam only received 3.68 million international tourists, which decreased 80% compared to 2019. By 2021, the number of visitors to Vietnam only reached 3500, a series of tourist accommodations, restaurants, and transport companies had to close. Many hotels mainly served domestic tourists with an average occupancy rate of about 10-15%. The VNAT estimates that 40% of workers in the hotel sector have quit or found other jobs during the COVID-19 pandemic.

1.3.2. Some challenges for Vietnam tourism

First, new risks and crises may occur to the tourism industry that will affect domestic tourism demand. One of them is the special operation between Russia and Ukraine that could last until 2024, even persist for many years, leading to a global economic recession and Vietnam cannot avoid that impact. High inflation rate may occur in the near future if the government does not take measures to control and stabilize consumer prices. This high inflation will also have a significant influence on the prices of tourism products and services, which directly impact on tourism demand, including domestic one. This is a macro-level challenge, deriving from the general context of the world economic situation as well as in Vietnam.

Second, challenges from fierce competition in attracting international tourists from countries in the region. In the context of the supply in key markets such as Northeast Asia, Western Europe and North America is shrinking due to inflation, war, and economic recession, countries in the region such as Thailand, Singapore, Malaysia, even Laos and Cambodia have also issued many new policies, making efforts to invest in renewing products and promoting to attract international tourists in the region. Therefore, the challenges Vietnam's tourism has to encounter is to come up with new strong, effective solutions for the investment, innovation in the tourism product development and market promotion in the new context.

Third, challenges come from tourism destination management at all levels, from national to local levels. At the national level, the limitations regarding the functions, missions and organizational structures of the central state managing agencies in charge of tourism may lead to the weak direction, facilitation, guidance and management for domestic market development. At the provincial level, the problems may occur from the business coordination and support to stimulate demand and market promotion. The problems also may derive from ensuring the tourism product's quality, managing a safe tourism environment, guaranteeing to provide the tourists with perfect services, experiences at the destinations.

Last, the challenges come from the demand for sustainable development in general and sustainable tourism development in particular. During the development, many challenges have arisen from 3 aspects of sustainable development including (i) economic, (ii) cultural and social and (iii) environmental ones, in which cultural, social and environmental challenges are among the most alarming issues in the tourism management. Some current prominent problems such as pollution caused by garbage and plastic waste in tourist destinations, the change of ethnic culture, overcrowding in some famous tourist destinations, etc.

1.4. Prospects and development trends of Vietnam's tourism industry in the post-COVID-19 pandemic context

1.4.1. The recovery prospect of the tourism industry in the post-pandemic context:

In 2022, Vietnam's tourism began to gradually recover with 3.44 million international tourists. Although it did not meet the target of 10 million visitors in 2022, domestic tourists in 2021 and 2022 still reached impressive numbers of 40 million and 101 million visitors, respectively. In 2022, the number of domestic tourists in Vietnam exceeded 85 million in 2019. In the first six months of 2023, Vietnam's tourism industry welcomed 5.6 million international tourists,

recovering 66% compared to 2019. The number of domestic tourists in the first 6 months of the year reached 64 million visitors, enabling the total revenue from tourists to reach 343 trillion VND. According to the VNAT's Results for the first 6 months of the year: Google's market trend tracker that aggregates data globally from mid-March to early June this year shows that the search volume of Vietnam's tourism growth is at 10%-25%, ranked 7th in the world. Vietnam is the only country in ASEAN to be in this group. The remaining countries ranked lower: Thailand (15), Indonesia (16), Malaysia (18), Philippines (20), Singapore (26). The most searched international markets for Vietnam tourism include the US, Japan, Australia, India, Korea, Singapore, UK, Malaysia, Germany, France. These are all key markets of Vietnam tourism. India and Australia are two big markets with strong growth potential because airlines have recently restored and expanded flight routes connecting cities of Vietnam and these two countries.

In terms of policy: On May 18, 2023, the Government issued Resolution No. 82/NQ-CP on the main missions and solutions to accelerate the recovery, the effective and sustainable tourism development with many solutions to develop Vietnam's tourism industry with specific orientations such as: ***Unique products - Professional services - Convenient and simple procedures - Competitive prices - Clean and beautiful hygienic environment - Safe, civilized, friendly destination***, enable the tourism industry to truly become the spearhead economic sector, belonging to top 30 countries with the highest competitive tourism capacity in the world.

1.4.2. Trends in consumption of green and sustainable tourism products, towards serving the experience and health of tourists.

The trend of tourists choosing green travel and close destinations, traveling with families, small groups or self-driving cars has remained one of the popular trends among domestic tourists since the outbreak of COVID-19 pandemic. Furthermore, this trend has continued in recent years. This reflects the survey results of domestic tourists carried out by the Institute for Tourism Development Research (2022) on several destinations with high interests in 2022 such as Destination close to nature (85.2%); Tourist attractions and entertainment (65.2%); Cultural tourist attractions (40.2%); Urban tourist attractions (18.9%); Spiritual tourist destination (20.5%); New tourist destination (36.1%). Those data shows that tourist destinations close to nature and green tourist destinations gain the most popularity among domestic tourists. Instead of choosing the fast trip stopping by many destinations during the journey, tourism has a tendency to be slower and to greener destinations which are close to nature, not to mention spending more time at the destinations. Therefore, eco-tourism and community-based tourism are the types associated with sustainable development and are being preferred in Vietnam. In Vietnam today, according to statistics of the VNAT, there are about 300 active community-based tourism destinations, most of these destinations are located in rural, mountainous or island areas, all of them are strongly associated with ecotourism destinations. Also, Vietnam currently has 23/33 national parks and 35/127 nature reserves that are implementing ecotourism activities. These are the favorite destinations of tourists in Vietnam.

1.4.3. Technology application trends in tourism business and management

The recent COVID-19 pandemic has had a severe impact on the tourism industry, but it is also an opportunity to demonstrate the power and effectiveness of using technology in tourism development and management. Commonly used technologies in the tourism industry such as virtual reality, augmented reality, artificial intelligence (AI), non-touch technologies, etc have been taken use of and been effective in tourism management and promotion, changing the fundamental method of tourism management and business.

II. CURRENT SITUATION OF PUBLIC PRIVATE DIALOGUE AND COOPERATION IN TOURISM DEVELOPMENT AND SUSTAINABLE TOURISM

2.1. Models of public-private dialogue and cooperation in tourism development in Vietnam until now

Tourism Advisory Board (TAB)

TAB was established on November 27, 2012 by the General Director of Vietnam National Administration of Tourism with the main function is to advise the General Director on issues related to the development of Vietnam's tourism industry, and to serve as a direct dialogue channel between the state management agency in tourism and related parties, especially the private sector. The establishment of TAB is an activity within the framework of the Project “Program for Developing Socially and Environmentally Responsible Tourism Capacity” (referred to as EU Project, funded by the European Union). The original members of TAB consisted of 23 individuals who were representatives of giant tourism enterprises such as Saigontourist, Thien Minh Group, Hanoi Tourism Corporation, Vina Capital, Sungroup, etc., and major carriers such as: Vietnam Airlines, Vietjet Air and representatives of the European Chamber of Commerce and Industry (EuroCham) and some managers from the public sector. The original chairman of TAB was Mr. Nguyen Van Tuan, General Director of VNAT. However, later, to strengthen the initiative of the business and private sectors in policy dialogue and consultation activities, the chairman of TAB was transferred to Mr. Tran Hung Viet, General Director of the Saigontourist tourism and finally Mr. Tran Trong Kien, chairman of Thien Minh Group. *The list of TAB members at the time of initial establishment is in Appendix I.*

TAB's mission is to strengthen Vietnam's competitive advantage as a sustainable tourism destination by leveraging resources from the public and private sectors, thereby creating a consistent and comprehensive industry strategy. According to the function, TAB advises the General Director of VNAT on tourism development issues in order to promote trade development and investment in Vietnam's tourism industry; serve as a platform for leaders of industry and ministries to discuss the related content on several aspects ranging from trade, environment, education to sustainable goals of the industry.

TAB has implemented consultancy through 03 main groups of activities:

Firstly, consult on tourism policy: A number of policy advisory activities have been implemented such as contributing to the policy of visa exemption for visitors in key different regions with an aim to open up the market, proposing policies to reduce land tax for businesses operating tourist accommodation establishments, etc.

Secondly, consult on training-related contents: This activity is associated with the support for improving the quality of tourism human resources of the EU-funded project. Thirdly, consult on the Vietnam tourism market, communication and promotion to the world. This is the most active and proactive activity that TAB has executed. Several specific activities are: (i) Support to organize the promotional tourism activities overseas (organize roadshow, attended 2 international fairs namely German ITB and British WTM), (ii) Support to build and maintain website that promotes tourism - Vietnam.travel – now is under the management of Tourist Information Center, VNAT); (iii) Support to develop several market reports, etc. In 2019, TAB opened TAB's tourism promotion office in London, UK but then closed due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

By 2020, according to the Decision of the General Director of VNAT, TAB has officially ceased its operation and has not been re-established or reorganized.

Vietnam Business Forum – VBF

This is a Vietnamese public-private dialogue channel organized annually by the Ministry of Planning and Investment and the Vietnam Chamber of Commerce and Industry since 2009. VBF exchanges all policy issues related to investment, the participation of the private sector in the economy, policies to support businesses, innovation in business, etc.

Tourism is one of the topics discussed in the VBF. The establishment of TAB as mentioned above is also one of the contents raised by European experts in the Forum for the first time held in 2009. Since then, tourism and tourism development in Vietnam has become the spearhead economic sectors often discussed at the forum's afternoon session and often attract many businesses, experts, and tourism investors to attend.

National conference on tourism

This is a conference chaired by the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism and assigned the VNAT to implement. The conference is usually held once a year to implement the tasks that the Government assigned the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism to implement. Participants in this Conference are quite diverse, including representatives of state management agencies at central and local levels, professional associations in tourism, a number of large and famous tourism enterprises in Vietnam, experts and researchers from institutes or universities have training in tourism. In this conference, the private sector are also able to raise their voices and join the discussion but usually those who speak up are chosen in advance and the number of them are limited.

Tourism thematic forums at the Vietnam International Travel Expo (VITM) in Hanoi and the International Travel Expo Ho Chi Minh City (ITE-HCMC).

VITM Hanoi is a Tourism Fair organized annually by the Vietnam Tourism Association (VITA) since 2013. These forums on the sidelines of these annual international tourism fairs in Vietnam are organized for businesses, experts, and managers to contribute ideas or give a common voice on a number of issues or policies related to tourism development of Vietnam. Some forums have been organized such as: Forum "Development of Vietnam's cultural tourism" at VITM 2023, National Tourism Forum "Vietnam Tourism Recovery – New Direction, New Action", Forum "Green Tourism" 2019, Forum "Online Tourism" at VITM in 2018 or Forum "Vietnam MICE Tourism" at ITE-HCMC in 2022, etc.

These forums are often associated with the topics of the Fair and are changed every year to suit the trend and situation of tourism development in Vietnam as well as in the world.

Besides the above public-private dialogue models, there are in fact a number of other dialogue models through the activities of some thematic tourism groups or clubs, specifically:

Vietnam Small and Medium Enterprise Tourism Forum (VTF- Vietnam Tourism Forum).

This is a form of club-based activities of tourism businesses throughout Vietnam. VTF was established in 2010 with the headquarter in Ho Chi Minh City and branches in the North, Central and South with about 600 members. VTF often organizes meetings or seminars on the sidelines of major events such as VITM Fair, ITE-HCMC or year-end summaries. Because the Forum acts as club, implements the activities based on the voluntariness of the members, at meetings, year-end summaries or congresses, VTF often invites representatives of state management agencies to participate such as the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism. local tourism management departments or tourism associations. VTF is also often invited and has a voice in tourism management forums or conferences in Vietnam.

UNESCO Hanoi Tourism Club:

Similar to VTF, UNESCO Hanoi Tourism Club operates in the form of a club on a voluntary basis of businesses and individuals with business or interest in tourism development. Up

to now, UNESCO Hanoi Tourism Club has about 1000 members. UNESCO Hanoi Tourism Club is often invited by provinces and state management agencies in tourism to participate and share their opinions at specialized seminars and forums on tourism development, supporting localities to organize survey missions and develop local tourism products.

Community Tourism Club - CTC

Founded in 2016, CTC now has about 500 official members who are businesses and about 8,000 associate members. CTC works with the purpose of supporting the local community in developing tourism products, connecting with businesses in selling products, developing markets and promoting destinations. Through CTC's activities, many community-based tourism destinations in Vietnam have been known to domestic and foreign tourists. In 2019, CTC became a branch of the Vietnam Tourism Association (VITA). CTC is also often invited to share their opinions in forums on sustainable tourism development, green tourism, community-based tourism across the country. Furthermore, CTC organizes seminars and forums on community tourism development by itself with the participation of state management agencies.

2.2. General assessment of these models

2.2.1. The achievements.

In general, the models or channels of public-private dialogue in Vietnam today are quite diverse. These models have recently made certain contributions to policy making and implementation. Some specific results are as follows:

- Participated and made contributions to a number of specific policies in tourism development and sustainable tourism development in Vietnam such as improving immigration policies, increasing the competitiveness of tourist destinations Vietnam; accelerate the promulgation of a number of policies related to community-based tourism development such as the promulgation of the National Standard on community-based tourism, the integration of rural tourism development into the National target program on building a new countryside in Vietnam, etc.

- Contributed significant resources for the communication, marketing and promotion of Vietnam destinations in the past time. Several supporting activities such as supporting VNAT to build a website aiming to promote Vietnam tourism, organize tourism promotional events both domestically and internationally, etc.

- Managing agencies has become more aware of the important role of the private sector/businesses in tourism development and has increased the accompaniment of businesses in the activities implementation such as product development, market promotion; thereby facilitating businesses in their investment and human resources training practices.

2.2.2. The limitations.

In addition to the above results, there are some limitations in public-private dialogue and cooperation in tourism development in recent years in Vietnam as follow:

- Channels for dialogue and public-private cooperation have been organized but are not frequent or dependent on certain actors/organizations. The case of TAB - a product of the EU Project, when the Project ends, the operating and supporting mechanisms for TAB gradually decrease and become inefficient.

- 99% of the private sector in the tourism industry in Vietnam is now micro, small and medium enterprises. However, the current public – private channels are mainly reserved for large private enterprises such as travel groups, carriers, etc. while small and medium-sized enterprises have very little chance to raise voice. Large corporations and businesses with ties to the

government as well as financial potential are tending to dominate the activities of management agencies in some provinces or major tourist destinations in Vietnam.

- The role of socio-professional organizations in tourism such as the Tourism Association in creating channels for dialogue or public-private cooperation has not been so effective. VTDF was established with the goal of mobilizing contributions from the private sector in tourism investment and development, but so far there is no mechanism to legally mobilize these contributions.

- Resources for building and maintaining these dialogue channels are limited, mainly depending on the state budget or occasional contributions from some enterprises. Therefore, the operational efficiency of these dialogue channels is not high.

III. CURRENT SITUATION OF VIETNAM TOURISM DEVELOPMENT FUND (VTDF)

3.1. VTDF overview

The Tourism Development Support Fund (VTDF - Vietnam Tourism Development Fund) was established in 2018 under the Prime Minister's Decision No. 49/2018/QĐ-TTg dated 12/12/2018. In terms of legal status, VTDF is an off-budget state financial fund, operating under the model of a one-member limited liability company with 100% charter capital held by the State and the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism is the owner representative.

The Fund's charter capital is VND 300,000,000,000 (three hundred billion VND), allocated from the central budget in the first 3 years after its establishment. The funding shall be made after the Fund has legal documents promulgated by the competent authorities on the organization, apparatus and accounting standard.

The annual operating budget allocated by the central budget is equal to 10% of the total annual budget gained from fees for the visa granting and documents for foreigners when exit and entry into Vietnam and 5% of total annual budget revenue and payment from visiting fees, interest from Fund's deposits at banks, sponsors, voluntary & legal contributions of businesses, organizations, individuals both internally and internationally for the Fund.

Funds allocated for the Fund's operations are mainly spent on the following activities:

a) Arrange funding for tourism promotion and advertising such as:

- Organize programs to introduce Vietnam tourism abroad;
- Attend international tourism fairs abroad;
- Coordinate and organize inter-country, regional and international tourism promotion activities;
- Promote Vietnam's tourism on advertising media, communication, at important economic, political and social events of Vietnam;
- Organize conferences, seminars, press conferences and events promoting Vietnam's tourism internally and internationally;
- Organize survey of tourism products and destinations in Vietnam for travel agencies, transport, domestic and foreign press to find out information, propagate and introduce about Vietnam's tourism;
- Organize activities to promote inter-regional and inter-local tourism;
- Develop e-marketing for tourism promotion and advertising;
- Support the construction and maintenance of the portal of promotion and electronic transactions in the field of tourism;
- Build databases and electronic publications; develop applications for smart mobile devices;
- Promote tourism on social media and search applications.
- Organize the production of publications and articles for tourism promotion and publicity;
- Build, develop and communicate Vietnam's tourism brand.

b) Support other tourism development activities:

- Support market research and tourism product development;
- Support in training and fostering the development of tourism human resources;
- Support tourism communication activities in the community.

3.2. Operational status of VTDF since its establishment until now

Although established in 2018, the Fund's apparatus and organizational structure have just been formed in 2021, the funding has just been granted and officially put into operation in 2022. In 2022, the Fund's operating budget allocated is about VND 152 billion.

Several activities in 2022 such as: Cooperate with VNAT and Vietnam Tourism Association to organize National Tourism Forum themed “Vietnam Tourism Recovery – New Direction, New Action” on the sidelines of Vietnam International Travel Expo in Hanoi 2022; support the Kon Tum province to organize a forum “Kon Tum Tourism - Potential and Prospects”; organize and participate 03 International Tourism Fairs (Travex fair in Indonesia, WTM in London and ITB Berlin, Germany); organize tourism promotion in Japan, Korea; support several provinces such as Ha Giang, Ninh Thuan to organize tourism promotion events at local level and welcome the fam trip of foreign businesses to conduct the survey, organize the market research for both domestic and international tourists. However, by 2022, the Fund just executed 15 out of 58 missions with the budget around 23 VND billion (accounting for 15% the total funding). The level of mobilization of funding sources, voluntary and legal contributions of domestic and foreign enterprises, organizations and individuals for the Fund to achieve the assigned target is 7,296 million VND (mainly the counterpart funding in the performance of duties).

3.2. The results and limitations

Results:

2022 is the first year that VTDF has been put into practice, having implemented 15 activities in the last 6 months of the year in the context of limited personnel and the fund's apparatus lacks many employees.

Limitations:

- Limited human resources and incomplete organizational structure (currently only 15 people)
- Complicated disbursement regulations and complicated approvals from the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism make the implementation slow
- Functions and duties of the Fund have not been clearly defined. The Fund manages both capital and directly implements tourism promotion activities, leading to overload in work.

V. SOME SET OF CRITERIA TO ASSESS TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN VIETNAM

5.1. The eco-label Green Lotus for hotels in Vietnam

The certificate of the sustainable tourism Green Lotus Label (Green Lotus Label) is applied in tourist accommodation in Vietnam. This label was issued by the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism and put into practice in 2012. The set of criteria is set out to encourage hotel businesses to participate in sustainable tourism activities. Hotel businesses participating in the program and meeting the criteria will be granted a *Sustainable Tourism Green Lotus Label Certificate* (referred to as *Green Lotus Label* for short). These facilities are active in environmental protection activities, efficient use of natural resources and energy, and contribute to heritage conservation, economic, cultural and social development. At the same time, these hotels pursue sustainable tourism development policies.

Green Lotus Label includes 5 levels: from level 1 Lotus - the lowest level to level 5 Lotus - the highest level. The number of lotuses that the hotel receives depends on the number of rating points it achieves in accordance with the sustainable tourism Green Lotus standards. All accommodations that have been evaluated and graded according to the Green Lotus standard will be given a mark appropriate to the level they receive. The Vietnam National Administration of Tourism will issue this Certificate. However, this program was piloted for 2 years and ended in 2016.

5.2. ASEAN Tourism Standard.

The ASEAN tourism standards have been developed by ASEAN member countries in order to define the framework of criteria, basic requirements for tourism products and services and to unify the implementation with an aim to improve the quality of ASEAN tourism, build ASEAN into a quality common destination “A Quality Single Destination”.

Up to now, there have been ASEAN tourism standards such as: (1) Clean tourist city, (2) Community-based tourism, (3) Green hotel, (4) Homestay (5) MICE venue, (6) Public restrooms, (7) Spa services. The ASEAN Tourism Awards 2023 held within the framework of the ASEAN Tourism Forum - ATF 2023 in Indonesia in January 2023 includes 04 award categories: Homestay ASEAN; ASEAN Community-based Tourism; ASEAN public restrooms; ASEAN Spa Services.

5.3. National Standard on Community-Based Tourism - Service Quality Requirements (TCVN 13259:2020)

National Standard on Community-Based Tourism - Service Quality Requirements (TCVN 13259:2020) was compiled and promulgated at the request of the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, and was issued by the Ministry of Science and Technology in 2020. This standard stipulates basic requirements for the quality of CBT services and products provided by stakeholders, such as service quality requirements for CBT guides, tourist information points community, sightseeing services, catering services, accommodation services; entertainment services, traditional cultural and artistic performances in the community and shopping for local products.

The set of criteria also outlines regulations on environmental protection, hygiene, security, and fire and explosion prevention; code of conduct for stakeholders involved in community tourism activities, sample of tourists' satisfaction survey about service quality at community tourist sites and resorts. Currently, localities in Vietnam are focusing on guiding local communities to apply this set of criteria in community-based tourism development.

5.4. The set of criteria to evaluate tourist destinations

The set of criteria to evaluate tourist destinations Issued together with Decision No. 4640/QĐ-BVHTTDL dated December 20, 2016 of the Minister of Culture, Sports and Tourism. The purpose of this Criteria is to strengthen the state management of tourism, encourage investment and upgrade service quality in destinations.

The set of criteria includes 61 criteria used to evaluate tourist sites and tourist attractions, of which 32 criteria (divided into 6 groups) evaluate tourist sites and 29 criteria (divided into 6 groups) evaluate tourist attractions. Some basic criteria groups to evaluate destinations in general, such as criteria group on tourism resources, products and services, destination management, infrastructure tourism, local community participation and tourist satisfaction. VNAT encourages localities to organize the evaluation annually. However, until now, the destination evaluations are hardly implemented in any provinces due to the lack of funding and expertise.

Above are some sets of criteria to evaluate the development of tourism in a number of different aspects and have been issued and implemented by tourism management agencies. In addition, there

are also a number of other criteria that are being researched and developed to be applied in the future, such as the set of criteria for assessing the green growth of tourist destinations, assigned by the MOCST to VNAT or the set of indicators to assess tourism competitiveness at the provincial level (VTCI) developed and evaluated by TAB.

5.6. General assessment

Currently, Vietnam has applied multiple sets of criteria to evaluate different aspects of tourism development and issued by different management agencies. Therefore, this has made businesses or local communities or even grassroots management confused to choose the proper one. Some sets of criteria are only piloted and then ended, while others are issued but not implemented in practice due to lack of resources.

However, there are some sets of criteria currently used by many destinations as a basis for implementation, such as sets of criteria on community-based tourism or some ASEAN tourism standards which are also being applied by many businesses.

V. SEVERAL SUGGESTIONS FOR RELATED ASPECTS.

5.1. Regarding the implementation of national and local tourism development policies and strategies

Based on the objectives and contents of the project's activities, the project should support the national tourism agency, specifically the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism, to implement two specific strategies:

First, the Strategy for Vietnam Tourism Development to 2030: This Strategy was issued in January 2020. However, due to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, this Strategy has not been implemented explicitly. The government and state management agencies in tourism in Vietnam have focused on dealing with and overcoming the repercussions caused by COVID-19. Therefore, this is high time to review and develop specific plans as well as support the implementation of tasks and solutions set out in the strategy. Some tasks and solutions in the Strategy that the Project can directly support to implement are as follows: (1) Completing institutions and policies for tourism development, including promoting public-private partnerships and governance models that integrate public and private sectors, entrepreneurs and communities localities in sustainable tourism development; facilitate the business environment, stimulate innovation, start-ups, develop business force, form many tourism businesses with strong brands; support small and medium enterprises, tourism business households to acquire new technology, digital skills and access to finance; (2) Developing tourism human resources and (3) Develop markets, products; step up promotion, communication, tourism branding; and international cooperation and integration in tourism.

Second, Vietnam tourism Marketing strategy to 2030. This strategy has just been issued in 2023 and is the realization of the solution on developing markets, products and promoting, advertising and building tourism brands in the Vietnam tourism development strategy to 2030. According to the strategy, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism sets a target that by 2025, Vietnam's tourism industry will recover and strive to welcome 18 million international visitors; serving 130 million domestic visitors, maintaining the growth rate of domestic visitors from 8 - 9%/year. By 2030, to welcome 35 million international visitors, the growth rate is from 13 - 15%/year; serving 160 million domestic tourists, the growth rate of domestic tourists is from 4-5%/year. Therefore, the ST4SD Project can support the VNAT to implement the following specific activities:

- Cooperate with VTDF to support the tourism market research in the context of post-COVID-19.

- Assist in the renewal of tourism promotion activities in one or two key tourism markets or explore one or two new markets.
- Support innovation, creation or implementation of new tourism marketing ideas for sustainable tourism. Marketing activities should highlight sustainability criteria that both educate and inspire tourists.
- Support in tourism E-marketing activities or smart tourism development in one or several specific tourist destinations.

5.2. Regarding the development of public-private dialogue models

Regarding the needs of different stakeholders in the Public-Private Dialogue Mechanism in Sustainable Tourism Development in Vietnam:

Public-private dialogue and cooperation benefit all stakeholders involved (Win-Win Cooperation). Therefore, all public and private partners have a demand to cooperate.

- State management agencies (public sector): Public-private partnerships will enhance resources for national or local tourism development and management. Public investment budget for tourism development is often limited; hence, more resources from the private side are needed, especially in tourism promotion activities, investment in infrastructure, technical facilities, etc. Tourism businesses are also pioneers in terms of applying technology and digitizing tourism business activities. Thus, public-private partnerships can also assist the government in accelerating the digitization and digital transformation of tourism management. In addition, the private sector is the subject of implementing policies issued by the public sector; therefore cooperation is required in order to make such policies effective. Also, the private sector can contribute to the formulation and promulgation of new tourism policies that are appropriate to the new context of tourism development in Vietnam.

+ The private sector (businesses, local communities, etc.): Tourism businesses in Vietnam are mainly small and medium enterprises, so they need the government's support in all aspects to develop, from facilitating and supporting the development of new types of sustainable tourism (community-based tourism, agritourism, farmstay, etc.) to tourism promotion activities, especially local communities, stakeholders who have little conditions/ resources to access the market or Organize professional marketing activities.

Some proposals on the model of public-private dialogue and cooperation in sustainable tourism development in Vietnam in the coming time

- *Build and apply the DMO – Destination Management Organization*: The 2017 Tourism Law clearly stipulates that there are two levels of destinations in Vietnam today, namely tourist areas (including national tourist areas and provincial tourist sites) and tourist attractions. Currently, the government has regulations and guidelines on the establishment of a National Tourism Area Management Board (2022). This board is under the management of the Provincial People's Committee. However, this Committee operates like an agency of local government without the participation of the private sector. In addition, tourist attractions still do not have a specific guide or management organization, mainly still managed by the Department of Tourism, the provincial Department of Culture, Sports and Tourism or the district People's Committee. Therefore, the construction of a DMO consisting of representatives from the government with the participation of the private sector such as tourism businesses or local communities will be a new model of management, dialogue and cooperation in tourism development. DMO will have a number of specific functions and cooperation activities in the following aspects:

+ Integrated Destination Planning: DMO facilitates the development of a comprehensive plan for the destination, including the goals of sustainable tourism, infrastructure development,

environmental protection, cultural preservation and community engagement. The plan should consider the unique characteristics and resources of the destination.

- + Public-private partnership activities: DMOs encourage public-private partnerships to leverage expertise, resources, and capital. The private sector can contribute financial resources, innovation, and market knowledge, while the public sector provides regulatory support, infrastructure development, and community engagement.

- + Sustainable infrastructure development: PPPs in the DMO model can be used to develop sustainable tourism infrastructure, such as eco-friendly accommodation, waste management systems, renewable energy installations, and transportation networks. These initiatives aim to reduce the environmental impact of tourism and enhance the visitor experience.

- + Capacity building and training: The DMO model emphasizes capacity building and training programs for local communities and tourism stakeholders. This includes providing training in sustainable tourism methods, entrepreneurship, cultural preservation and community engagement. The DMO coordinates and supports these initiatives to ensure long-term benefits for the local workforce.

- + Marketing and Promotion: DMO works with the private sector to develop effective marketing and promotion strategies for the destination. This includes branding, digital marketing and targeted campaigns to attract responsible and sustainable visitors. DMO also encourages cooperation between tourism businesses to enhance the overall competitiveness of the destination.

- + Monitor and Evaluate: The DMO is responsible for monitoring the progress of sustainable tourism development initiatives, assessing their impact, and adjusting strategies accordingly. Periodic reviews ensure the effectiveness of the PPP and allow for adjustments to achieve long-term sustainability goals.

- *Building and organizing a forum for sustainable tourism in Vietnam every 2 years on 2 levels namely national and provincial level.* National forum can be held in even years and provincial forum can be held in odd years. Information, experiences, results of dialogue and cooperation at the provincial level will be discussed and shared at the national level. VNAT can cooperate with VITA or another prestigious stakeholder (university, corporate research institution or company or business) to co-organize this Forum. This will be a channel for dialogue and provide ideas, orientation for the promulgation, implementation of policies as well as sharing and cooperation in implementing new tourism marketing ideas.

- *Support the formation and operation of new professional social groups related to sustainable tourism development:* Previously, in 2009, about 10 small and medium tourism enterprises were established (RTC- Responsible Travel Club Vietnam) with the purpose of promoting and propagating sustainable tourism activities, responsible tourism in Vietnam. However, after a few years of operation, RTC has now ceased operations and is planning to restart the club's activities. In addition, the project can also support the activities of the Community Tourism Club (CTC) in terms of strengthening the organization, promoting activities to support the community in tourism development and sustainable tourism in the local area.

5.3. Regarding the building and application of the tourism development index

According to the aforementioned situation assessment, Vietnam currently has a number of sets of criteria or indicators to evaluate tourism development. However, a number of indicators cannot be implemented due to: (1) Not feasible in practice. (2) There are no resources to continue the assessment after the issuance and (3) Ambiguous responsibilities of the actors in the implementation, resulting in no one being responsible for the implementation. Therefore, in order to develop and apply those indicators and make it possible in the future, it is necessary to specify

the actors who will implement, how to apply and maintain them. Based on that, some proposals for the Project are as follows:

First, develop a set of criteria for Tourism Villages in Vietnam. Currently, community-based tourism activities have developed significantly in Vietnam. More than 300 aforementioned tourist attractions means that there have been more than 300 villages in the countryside of Vietnam. Vietnam and ASEAN have several set of criteria, indicators that guide the development of the community-based tourism attractions; still, there has not had any criteria/ indicators specifying for the Tourism Villages yet. In addition, there are many similar models in the world. In particular, United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) also had the award for the best tourist village in the world every year (UNWTO Best Tourism Village). In Thailand, based on the project learning from Japan - OTOP (One Tambon One Product), the Thailand Government has built the OTOP model – OTOP tourism village. This model has been successful in Thailand in the past 10 years. Therefore, ST4SD can support the Vietnam tourism sector to build a set of criteria/ indicators for establishment/ evaluation/ recognition VTV-Vietnam Tourism Village or VBTV-Vietnam Beautiful Tourism Village. Following that support, ST4SD can continue its support in the establishment of VTVC- Vietnam Tourism Villages Club. This club is expected to have operating regulations and an executive board. It is this executive board that will decide on the recognition of members of the Club according to the criteria developed by the project. Once a tourist village has been recognized and admitted to the Club, it can enjoy the benefits of communication, promotion, market development support, official support from the government, etc. Thus, the impact and result of ST4SD can last even the duration of the project ends. The building of this set of criteria can learn from the previous experience, the UNWTO set of criteria and those of the other countries in the region. In other words, on completion, this set of criteria can also be upgraded to an internationally recognized set of criteria (UNWTO or ASEAN).

Second, the project can support the development of a set of criteria that evaluates the contribution of tourism to the socio-economic status of a province. Many provinces of Vietnam have now identified tourism development as an important economic sector or even a spearhead economic sector. However, determining the contribution rate of tourism to the GRDP has not been done in a methodical and similar manner throughout the country. Therefore, if the project can support this activity, it will help the provinces more accurately assess the contribution of tourism to the local economy and then have appropriate policies/ plans for sustainable tourism development. If this set of criteria is promulgated and guided for consistent implementation throughout the country, localities will be able to proactively self-assess each year. On that basis, the government can evaluate the overall contribution rate of tourism to Vietnam's GDP.

5.4. Regarding the Swiss consultancy

Based on the proposals for the aforementioned issues, regarding the Swiss consultancy, there are some specific proposals as follows:

- The Swiss consultant proposes a public-private dialogue model suitable to the Vietnamese context as well as inheriting Switzerland and international experiences in this field. The proposed model and operation will be carried out at both national and provincial level.
- Support VNAT, provinces, selected destinations in the implementation of National Strategy for Tourism. Also, support to develop the planning and action plans in some localities as well as innovative marketing activities for Vietnam tourism in the coming time.
- Share experience in developing a set of indicators and managing activities of the Vietnam Tourism Village model on the basis of the model of a Swiss tourist village/farm or some other developed countries.

- Propose to develop a new set of criteria for sustainable tourism development and management to apply in the post-COVID-19 context, based on Swiss or international experience, that can be applied to Vietnam./.

APPENDIX 1
MEMBERS OF TAB UNDER THE ESTABLISHMENT DECISION OF VNAT IN 2012

No	Name	Position	Organization
1	Mr. Nguyen Van Tuan	General Director	VNAT
2	Mr. Tran Hung Viet	General manager	Saigon Tourism Corporation
3	Mr. Kenneth Atkinson	Chairman of Subcommittee on Tourism and Hospitality	Eurocham
4	Mr. Tran Ngoc Luong	Deputy General manager	Muong Thanh Hotel Group
5	Mr. Tran Doan The Duy	Deputy General manager	Vietravel Company
6	Mr. George Ehrlich Adam	General manager	Công ty TNHH Du lịch Exotissimo
7	Mr. Trinh Hong Quang	Deputy General manager	Vietnam Airlines Corporation
8	Mr. Luu Duc Khanh	CEO	VietJet Aviation Joint Stock Company
9	Ms. Duong Thi Thu Huong	General manager	Minh Viet Service Co., Ltd
10	Mr. Pham Duc Hung	General manager	Hanoi Tourism Corporation
11	Mr. Tran Trong Kien	Chairman of directors	Thien Minh Tourism Joint Stock Company
12	Mr. Ngo Minh Duc	Director	HG Travel Service Company
13	Mr. Dang Minh Truong	General manager	Sun Group Joint Stock Company
14	Mr. Jon Tomlinson	Director of Development and Management of Resorts and Hotels	Indochina Capital Group
15	Mr. Craig Douglas	Director of Investment Management Department of Hotel Projects	VinaCapital Group
16	Mr. Vu The Binh	Vice President	Vietnam Tourism Association
17	Ms. Pham Thi Thu Hang	General secretary	Vietnam Chamber of Commerce and Industry
18	Mr. Nguyen Chi Trung	Director	Hoi An Cultural Heritage Management Center
19	Mr. Vu Hoai Phuong	President	Hue Tourism Vocational College
20	Mr. Vu An Dan	Vice Dean in charge of Faculty of Tourism	Hanoi Open University

21	Mr. Nguyen Van Luu	Former Deputy Director of Training Department	MoCST
22	Ms. Nguyen Thi Thanh Huong	Chief of staff	VNAT
23	Mr. Hoang Hoa Quan	Head of General Emulation Department	VNAT

APPENDIX 2:
DECISION ISSUES A SET OF CRITERIA FOR ASSESSMENT
OF TOURISM DESTINATIONS

**MINISTRY OF CULTURE, SPORTS
AND TOURISM**

SOCIALIST REPUBLIC OF VIETNAM
Independence - Freedom – Happiness

No: 4640/QD-BVHTTDL

Hanoi, 28 December 2016

DECISION
ON A SET OF CRITERIA FOR ASSESSMENT OF TOURISM DESTINATIONS
MINISTER OF CULTURE, SPORTS AND TOURISM

Based on Decree No. 76/2013/ND-CP dated July 16, 2013 of the Government defining the functions, missions, authorities and organizational structure of the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism;

Based on Resolution No. 92/NQ-CP dated December 8, 2014 of the Government on a number of solutions to promote tourism development in Vietnam in the new period;

Based on the Prime Minister's Decision No. 321/QD-TTg dated February 18, 2013 approving the National Action Program on Tourism for the period 2013-2020;;

Consider the proposal of the Director General of the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism seriously:

DECISION:

Article 1. Approve the “Set of criteria for evaluation of tourist destinations” with the following main contents:

1. Objective

Develop a set of criteria for evaluation of tourist destinations to strengthen the state management of tourism, encourage investment and upgrade service quality at destinations.

2. Identify destinations to evaluate

a) Based on the ability to attract tourists:

- Tourist sites: including tourist areas that have been invested in tourism development, receiving 500,000 or more tourists annually.

- Tourist attractions: including tourist attractions that have been invested in tourism development, receiving 50,000 or more tourists every year.

b) Based on the proposal of the tourist area or destination:

Tourist sites/attractions that meet the requirements on ability to attract tourists, have dossiers of request for assessment, sent to the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism.

3. Criteria for evaluating tourist sites

A total of 32 criteria are divided into 6 groups, specifically as follows:

a) Criteria for tourism resources:

+ Diversity and uniqueness of resources

+ Capacity of resource sites

+ Protection and embellishment of resources

b) Criteria for products and services:

- + Provide information for customers
- + Information guide in the entire tourist site
- + Guides
- + Tourist information center
- + System of technical facilities to serve the accommodation
- + Services provided to guests in the accommodation areas
- + Restaurant system
- + Food service
- + Entertainment facilities
- + Entertainment and recreation services
- + Performance activities, art performances
- + Services for sightseeing, relaxation, discovery, and learning about natural and cultural values
- + Shopping services

c) Criteria for destination management:

- + General management
- + Natural environment and general hygiene
- + Waste disposal
- + Public restroom system
- + Social environment
- + Organize security forces
- + Plan to ensure security and safety for tourists
- + Technical facilities

d) Criteria for infrastructure:

- + Road system
- + Signage indicating the approach to the tourist sites by road or waterway
- + Internal roads
- + Electricity system
- + Water supply and drainage system

d) Criteria for local community participation:

- + Percentage of local workers in the tourist sites

e) Criteria for tourist satisfaction:

- + Tourist satisfaction through questionnaires

4. Criteria for evaluating tourist attractions

A total of 29 criteria are divided into 6 groups, specifically as follows:

a) Criteria for tourism resources:

- + Diversity and uniqueness of resources
- + Capacity of resource sites
- + Protection and embellishment of resources

b) Criteria for products and services:

- + Provide information for customers
- + Information guide in the entire tourist site
- + Guides
- + Tourist information counter
- + System of technical facilities to serve the accommodation
- + Services provided to guests in the accommodation areas
- + Restaurant system

- + Food service
- + Services for sightseeing, relaxation, discovery, and learning about natural and cultural values
- + Services for organizing events, conferences, seminars
- + Shopping services

c) Criteria for destination management:

- + General management
- + Natural environment and general hygiene
- + Waste disposal
- + Public restroom system
- + Social environment
- + Organize security forces
- + Plan to ensure security and safety for tourists
- + Technical facilities

d) Criteria for infrastructure:

- + Road system
- + Signage indicating the approach to the tourist sites by road or waterway
- + Internal roads
- + Electricity system
- + Water supply and drainage system

d) Criteria for local community participation:

- + Percentage of local workers in the tourist sites

e) Criteria for tourist satisfaction:

- + Tourist satisfaction through questionnaires

5. Destination evaluation process

- Destination assessment is carried out according to the process accompanying this decision.
- Survey form to collect feedback from guests attached to this decision.
- Step 1: Establish the Organizing Committee and establish the Sub-committees of Content, Secretary, Logistics, etc.
- Step 2: Select the destination to evaluate.
- Step 3: Form expert groups including: Assessment expert group and investigative expert group
- Step 4: Groups of experts evaluate and score points according to the mark scheme; organize surveys to collect opinions, feedback of tourists according to survey forms
- Step 5: The Secretarial Subcommittee gathers all the scores
- Step 6: The Organizing Committee ranks the destination

6. Destination evaluation frequency

To honor destinations, motivate destinations to strive, maintain service quality, environmental quality and attractiveness of destinations: VNAT conducts periodic evaluation and publishes with frequency once a year.

Article 2. Implementation

1. VNAT:

- Chair, coordinate with related units to spread widely the set of criteria to provinces, boards of destination management of specific national tourism site/ attraction; guide localities to implement the proper destination evaluation depends on each purpose;

- Chair, coordinate with related units to apply the set of criteria, realize the assessment, honor the tourism sites/attractions that are highly appreciated because of their management, service quality, environment protection and attractiveness, etc.
- Continue to conduct research, develop the set of criteria, build national criteria on destination management.

2. Departments of Culture, Sports and Tourism of provinces and municipal city.

- Disseminate the set of criteria of tourism sites/ attractions of the provinces to orientate the investment, service development, management, etc. to ensure professionalism.
- Based on the provinces' demands, apply the set of criteria, assess and evaluate, and honor the tourism sites/ attractions.

3. Tourism Association

- Cooperate with VNAT, MoCST and Tourism Association of localities to disseminate the set of criteria to apply in the management, investment and activities in order to enhance the professionalism of destinations that are the members of Association.
- Cooperate with VNAT, MoCST and Tourism Association of localities to assess the set of criteria and honor the destinations.

4. Board of Tourism sites/ attractions.

Research, apply the set of criteria in the investment process and activities management to develop tourism sites/ attractions

Respond to activities organized by VNAT, MoCST and Tourism Association at all levels to assess, honor the destinations, contributing to the professionalism and images of Vietnam via tourists' lens.

Article 3. This Decision takes effect from the signing date.

Article 4. Chief of Office of the Ministry, General Director of VNAT, Directors of DoMST of provinces and municipal city, organizations and individuals involved in Tourism activities are responsible for the implementation of this Decision./.

Recipients:

- As in Article 4;

- Prime Minister, Deputy Prime Ministers;
- Central propaganda and training commission
- The Government Office
- National Assembly National Assembly Committee on Culture and Ethnic Minority Affairs
- People's Committees of provinces and municipal cities;
- The Deputy Ministers of Culture, Sports and Tourism
- Agencies and units under the Ministry;
- DoTSC of provinces and municipal cities;
- Website of the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Tourism Information Center - Save: VNAT (Travel Department), LTH (05b). 200

Minister

Nguyen Ngoc Thien